

Minutes of the Board meeting 2023-02 on 15 June 2023

Time of the meeting: 15 June 2023 at 17H00

Place of the meeting: **CAMPUS SURSEE Seminarzentrum AG**

Indico: <https://indico.cern.ch/event/1277327/>

1. Welcome and agenda

Ben Kilminster, the CHIPP Chair, is chairing the meeting. Kilminster welcomes the Board members, the honorary Board members, and the observers to the Board. The Chairman welcomes the new Board members, two voting members: Frederic Blanc (EPFL) and Harald Ita (PSI/UZH).
The agenda is approved.

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

2. Apologies and Proxy votes

Board members with voting rights (as of 1 March 2023): 76
present (in-person and via ZOOM): Beck, Braccini, Caminada, Crivelli, Donegà, Greljo, Gehrmann T., Gehrmann-de Ridder A., Golling, Grazzini, Hildebrandt, Isidori, Kilminster, Kunz, Lauss, Müller, Schramm, Seidel, Serra, Sfyrla, Signer, Spira, Sanchez-Nieto, Sgalaberna, Soter, Tykhonov, Weber.

Other participants: Benelli (Admin.), Stocker (Obs. SERI), Fischer (Obs. SNF), Graverini (EPFL), Rivkin (Pr. Em.)

Apologies: Christopher Grab, Maurice Bourquin, Peter Stoffer.

The Chair details the proxy votes announced before the meeting¹.

Quorum: 24 votes (= 1/3 of the Board members; Art. 24.1 Statutes); voters present: 27 present + 9 proxies = 35 -> The quorum is reached

3. Minutes of the last meeting (2023-01 [March 2023]): The Chair asks for comments concerning the minutes of the previous meeting. Since there are none, the Chair invites the Board to approve them. The minutes are approved and will be published on the [CHIPP](https://chipp.ch) website.

DECISION ITEMS

4. Election of one Executive Board member

The current composition of the Executive Board is: **Ben Kilminster** (UZH) Chair, until Dec 2024, **Tobias Golling** (Uni. Ge), until Dec 2023, **Michael Spira** (PSI), until Dec 2024, **Paolo Crivelli** (ETHZ), until Dec 2024. Tobias will reach the end of his term in December and has expressed his willingness to serve for another term.

¹Malte Hildebrandt for Klaus Kirch, Anna Sfyrla for Radoslav Marchevski, Nicola Serra for Lesya Shchutka, Mike Seidel for Olivier Schneider, Thomas Gehrmann for Stefano Pozzorini, Saverio Braccini for Thomas Becher, Mauro Donega for Annapaola DeCosa, Ben Kilminster for Florencia Canelli, Paolo Crivelli for Rainer Wallny

The Board elects Tobias Golling unanimously as vice-chair in the EB (Jan. 2024 – Dec. 2025) for his second term.

5. Nomination for election of one Swiss Restricted-ECFA representative

The election of the Swiss representatives in the European Committee for Future Accelerators (ECFA) belongs to the CHIPP Plenary, based on a recommendation by the Board. The present Swiss representatives in ECFA are:

- **Michele Weber** (U. Bern), Restricted ECFA and Plenary ECFA member until Dec 2023, 1st term
- **Frederic Blanc** (EPFL), Plenary ECFA member until Dec 2024, 2nd term
- **Philipp S. Wellenbug** (PSI), Plenary ECFA member until Dec 2024, 1st term
- **Annapaola De Cosa** (ETHZ), Plenary ECFA member until Dec 2025, 1st term

Michele Weber was elected for a year-long term to replace M. Seidel; the EB made a call for nominations resulting in two candidates: Rainer Wallny (ETHZ) and Massimiliano Grazzini (UZH).

Massimiliano Grazzini is present, he introduces himself and explains his motivations about his candidacy: he believes that it is important in this moment to have a theoretician in the RECFA panel to motivate and direct the future of particle physics towards FCC since it's the only valid option we have. Rainer Wallny is not present for personal reasons; he wrote a letter that Kilminster reads. As a former CHIPP chair and a roadmap editor, he has a good overview of the activities of the experimental and the theoretical community in Switzerland, as well as the international landscape. "In these times", he writes, "it is important that we coordinate our R&D efforts for the future experiments."

The Board votes (20 votes for R. Wallny, 12 votes for M. Grazzini, 6 abs.) and submits to the Plenary for election:

Rainer Wallny (ETHZ) Restricted ECFA for a 1st three-year term (Jan. 2024 – Dec. 2026)

6. Nomination for election of the APPEC representative

Switzerland has been a member of the AstroParticle Physics European Consortium (APPEC) since 2013. Xin Wuas, Swiss representative, would like to step down from this position. Teresa Montaruli (UniGe) was nominated.

The Board unanimously elects Teresa Montaruli (UniGe) for a 1st term (Jan 2024 – Dec. 2025) as APPEC General Assembly scientific delegate.

7. Re-election of the IPPOG representative

The International Particle Physics Outreach Group (IPPOG) is a network of scientists, science educators and communication specialists working across the globe in science education and public outreach for particle physics. IPPOG brings new discoveries to this exciting field to young people and conveys to the public that the beauty of nature is indeed becoming understandable from the interactions of its most fundamental parts - the elementary particles. Katharina Müller agrees to represent Switzerland for another term; after this she would like to step down.

The Board unanimously re-elects Katharina Müller (University of Zurich) for a 4th term (Sep. 2023 – Sep. 2025) as IPPOG Swiss representative.

8. Re-election of the EPPCN representative

The CERN Council established a network of closely cooperating professional communication officers from each CERN Member State in 2006 at DESY Zeuthen as part of the European Strategy for Particle Physics. The Member state representatives have the duty to incorporate existing activities, propose, implement, and monitor a European particle physics communication and education strategy, and report on a regular basis to the CERN Council. In June 2017, Angela Benelli as CHIPP administrator accepted the responsibility to be the new Swiss EPPCN representative. This position is supported by a SERI contribution and a CERN grant to cover travel and other expenses.

The Board re-elects Angela Benelli as Swiss representative in EPPCN from January 2024 to December 2026.

9. Re-election of one CHIPP Auditor

The Chair reminds us that the election of the CHIPP Account Auditor belongs to the CHIPP Board. CHIPP has two auditors: Saverio Braccini (UniBe) and Steven Schramm (UniGe). Saverio Braccini has expressed his willingness to serve for another term.

The Board unanimously elects Saverio Braccini for a second term as CHIPP auditor (Jun 2023 – Jun 2026).

10. Re-election of the CSR Observer

The Committee on Space Research (CSR) of the Swiss Academy of Sciences (SCNAT) coordinates and stimulates space research in Switzerland. It maintains contact with international organizations such as the European Space Agency ESA and the Committee of Space Research COSPAR. Since October 2014, CHIPP has been invited to nominate a person who would serve as official link between CHIPP and the CSR. Xin Wu reminds the Board that the funding for the projects under the umbrella of the CSR comes from Prodex, a separate funding mechanism from FLARE. Prodex promotes the close collaboration between the academy and industry.

The Board unanimously re-elects Xin Wu (University of Geneva) for a 5th term (Jan. 2024 – Dec. 2025) as CSR representative.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

Ben Kilminster informs the Board about the appointments of the following CHIPP Functions by the EB:

- The EB appointed **Tobias Golling** as the PI for the M&O CHIPP FLARE request.
- The EB appointed **Michael Spira** and **Paolo Crivelli** as graduate student education coordinators, CHIPP PhD School coordinators. Annapaola De Cosa and Lesya Shchutka continue in their roles of CHIPP Winter school organizers.

Currently, Katharina Müller is CHIPP Outreach & Education Coordinator, Elena Graverini is Deputy Coordinator. She is moving out of Switzerland (professor at Pisa, congratulations!) and it is very likely that she will step down by September 2023.

The Chairman asks for nominations for a replacement:

Please send nominations by mid-September
Term should be at least ~2 years

11. CHIPP Roadmap

The chairman reports on the road map update that CHIPP is planning. The previous Roadmap update was in 2020 with the title "Roadmap for research and infrastructure 2025 to 2028 and beyond", in which we already have a description of projects beyond 2028. This document is 100 pages long and it is the important input for FLARE considerations for funding for research infrastructure. Since the CHIPP vision for the future hasn't changed much since the publication of the document, our next roadmap will be a shorter document, more to the point, on planning for two FLARE funding periods: 2025-28 and 2029-32.

We're trying to organize this within each pillar and collect input for these two periods. We do not need to spend a lot of time extensively justifying the science; we're going to try to focus on:

- the listing of the experimental projects
- the timelines and phases
- the size and importance of the Swiss involvement
- designation of flagship versus fair share projects
- recommendations

We have a rough schedule for how we're going to produce this document and so far, we're on schedule. The Roadmap workshop will be January 18th-19th 2024. Please reserve the dates.

In the beginning of May there was an organizational meeting between all the interested parties besides particle physics; the process hasn't quite converged yet, but we are going to continue our schedule and plan in view of the FLARE funding requests.

We have established some section editors for each community, and we ask the Board to endorse them:

- **Coordination:** Ben Kilminster
- **Pillar-1 low energy:** Paolo Crivelli
- **Pillar-1 high energy:** Tobias Golling
- **Pillar-2:** Michele Weber, Davide Sgalaberna
- **Pillar-3:** Teresa Montaruli
- **Tech Transfer:** Günther Dissertori
- **Outreach:** Katharina Müller
- **Theory:** Gino Isidori
- **Accelerator:** Mike Seidel

The Board endorses the team of editors.

In January at the Roadmap workshop, we will discuss the input from the pillars and the FLARE requests. We would like to have presentations from each sort of experimental direction, so that we understand the goals and the importance of these projects. During the second quarter of 2024 we will try to draft the document together and then get final approval in September.

12. Flare presentation

The chairman shows the Board the preliminary FLARE summary table, with the funds granted for 2020-24 and the requests for 2025-28 and 2029-32. It becomes relevant why we need to do the planning exercises from the BFI dispatch for 2025-28. The preliminarily total funding will be 44 MCHF. Particle physics is receiving about 80%-85% of this amount; the rest is for ground-based experiments in Astronomy. At this moment, the CHIPP FLARE request for 2025-28 is 47.7 MCHF, which is a preliminary sum and needs to be reduced. There are experiments like SHiP and NA62 which need to be approved for starting or continuation and there are experiments like the Einstein Telescope, which are between CHIPP and CHAPS, so there is still uncertainty in this calculation. The Tier-2 computing request which is under the uncuttable category has increased the request a lot compared to the past. It needs to be verified what is under a service contract and possibly divide the request in two: one uncuttable and one that will be submitted to the same competition as the other requests.

13. Third-party funding

The chairman reminds the Board about the decreasing trend of success rates of fundamental physics project grants from SNF in the last few years. The new trend for zero grants with criticism of sub-projects, rather than cutting them slightly, has created big problems for research groups. SNF has criteria such as scientific relevance, topicality and originality, suitability of methods, feasibility, and qualifications of researchers to select successful projects to fund.

CHIPP has been investigating this, and providing feedback to SNF at the SPS annual meeting 2022:

- Plenary Session & Special: Physics funding in Switzerland with the Presentations from Michele Weber (CHIPP chair), Bernd Gotsmann (SNF div-II head), and Thierry Giamarchi (MaNEP spokesperson)
- Summary in October 2022 [SPG Mitteilungen Communications de la SSP](#)

This year at the SPS annual meeting 2023 the discussion will continue:

- Bernd Gotsmann will represent SNF
- Ben Kilminster has been invited to give another presentation on behalf of CHIPP

Kilminster would like to discuss with the Board the several points that can be brought to this discussion:

- Switzerland strategically supports experimental efforts (FLARE, SERI, etc.)
 - These often represent long-term investments in experimental programs, R&D, construction and operation of experiments.
 - Cutting grants on these efforts damages Swiss investment.
 - Suggestion: SNF council could consider Swiss investment in grant decisions.
- Switzerland is a small country
 - Often only one or a few groups are working on a line of research.
 - The effect of low grant success ~30% cuts is more severe than in big countries (like U.S.).
 - Suggestion: SNF council could consider risks of cutting research
- SNF requires “novelty” in all sub-projects
 - How is the support of necessary but “mundane” projects like detector maintenance and calibration factored?

- These service tasks are required by experiments and important for students, postdocs education.

Suggestion: Some fraction of project grant could be subject to different criteria (maintaining Swiss responsibilities to experiments without cutting new projects)

Suggestion: FLARE could accommodate students/postdocs detector service work

The general concern that Kilminster points out is that the SNF funding is not decreasing, but the number of applications from applied science is increasing, which brings a lower success rate in fundamental science.

- Typically, the number of applied science grants proposed is smaller, but it is increasing.
- Does fundamental science need protection?

Suggestions:

- Can fundamental science be partitioned into its own funding category?
- Can we learn from other countries?
- Perhaps we can invite some experts from other countries to review our funding mechanisms?

Another point of discussion is also the ability of Switzerland to recruit top talent while grant success rates are falling.

The Board suggests adding to the experimentalists point of view that of theoreticians. The situation is changing in the field of theory; highly relevant calculations are missing for the Hi-Lunii option of the LHC (check this with M. Spira). These are long term projects which are lasting 4-5-6 years and combine efforts with other people and with PhD students and postdocs. If the funding is cut for these projects the experimentalists will have to work with poor predictions that could affect the decisions for the future path of particle physics.

14. R-ECFA Country Visit

The R-ECFA Visit to a member state is supposed to occur every seven years; the last visit to Switzerland was in 2016 at ETHZ <https://indico.cern.ch/event/513150/>. The EB has arranged a possible date with ECFA Chairman Karl Jakobs, of 8-9th March 2024 at PSI. Typically, there is one day of presentations from different aspects of particles physics: theory, detectors, accelerators, low energy precision, etc. In the next few months, we'll be trying to plan these presentations and look for speakers. The second day, Saturday, will be reserved for the R-ECFA members.

INFORMATION ITEMS

15. New professorships at CHIPP institutes: report from each institute

Jointly UZH/PSI a new assistant professor working in particle theory.

16. A.O.B. Next meetings

SPS/OPG/CHIPP Annual meeting

Date: 4-8 September 2023

Location: Basel

CERN70:

Dates: 18 October 2024

Location: CERN

CHIPP Board 2023-03 Meeting:

Date: October 20, 2023

Location: To be confirmed

Roadmap Workshop:

Dates: January 18-19, 2024

Location: Hotel Balsthal,
Falkensteinerstrasse 1, 4710 Balsthal

RECFA Country visit:

Dates: 8-9 March 2024

Location: PSI